

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS**

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.

Plaintiffs,

v.

JETBLUE AIRWAYS CORPORATION and
SPIRIT AIRLINES, INC.

Defendants.

Case No. 1:23-cv-10511-WGY

GABRIEL GARAVANIAN, et al.

Plaintiffs,

v.

JETBLUE AIRWAYS CORPORATION and
SPIRIT AIRLINES, INC.

Defendants.

Case No. 1:23-cv-10678-WGY

**JOINT MOTION FOR ENTRY OF STIPULATED JOINT PROTECTIVE ORDER AND
ORDER GOVERNING PRODUCTION OF INVESTIGATION MATERIALS**

In accordance with Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and Rule 7.2 of the Local Civil Rules, all Parties to the Government Action and the Private Action respectfully move for entry of the attached Stipulated Joint Protective Order and Order Governing Production of Investigations Materials (“Joint Protective Order”) in both actions.¹

¹ The “Government Action” means *United States v. JetBlue Airways Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-10511-WGY, and the “Private Action” means *Garavanian v. JetBlue Airways Corp.*, Case No. 1:23-cv-10678-WGY. The “Government” means the plaintiffs in the Government Action. The “Parties” means all parties to both actions.

The Parties have agreed to the proposed Joint Protective Order as a compromise to resolve one of the United States' objections to the proposed case management order in the Private Action, embodied in Paragraph 3 of the United States' May 3, 2023 Proposed Order (Private Action ECF No. 78-1). The proposed Joint Protective Order provides for disclosure of material from the Government Action in the Private Action, but only after non-parties that provided such material receive notice and the opportunity to object in the Private Action, as well as the same level of protection in the Private Action as in the Government Action. *See* Joint Protective Order ¶¶ 24-25, 29-30.²

WHEREFORE, the Parties respectfully request that the Court enter the attached proposed Joint Protective Order.³

Dated: May 26, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Joseph M. Alioto Jr.

Joseph M. Alioto Jr.
ALIOTO LEGAL
100 Pine Street, Suite 1250
San Francisco, California 94111
joseph@aliotolegal.com

/s/ Stephen G. Larson

Stephen G. Larson
LARSON LLP
555 South Flower Street, Suite 4400
Los Angeles, California 90071
slarson@larsonllp.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Gabriel Garavanian, et al.

/s/ Edward W. Duffy

Edward W. Duffy
John M. Briggs
United States Department of Justice
Antitrust Division
450 Fifth Street, NW, Suite 4000
Washington, D.C. 20530
Telephone: (202) 812-4723
Fax: (202) 307-5802
Email: edward.duffy@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of America

/s/ William T. Matlack

William T. Matlack (MA Bar No. 552109)
Office of the Attorney General
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor

² By submitting the proposed Joint Protective Order, none of the Parties takes a position on any objections that non-parties may make after receiving notice of the proposed Joint Protective Order.

³ The Parties are not at this time seeking to file any documents with the Court under seal. Rather, they wish to limit the dissemination of documents, testimony, and information provided by the Parties and non-parties during discovery. In accordance with Paragraph 48 of the proposed Order, the Parties will only file Confidential Information or Highly Confidential Information under seal pursuant to Local Rule 7.2 regarding Impoundment and Confidential Materials.

/s/ Elizabeth M. Wright

Elizabeth M. Wright (MA BBO #569387)

Zachary R. Hafer (MA BBO #569389)

COOLEY LLP

500 Boylston Street, 14th Floor

Boston, MA 02116

Telephone: (617) 937-2349

ewright@cooley.com

zhafer@cooley.com

Ethan Glass (*admitted pro hac vice*)

COOLEY LLP

1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20004

Telephone: (202) 842-7800

eglass@cooley.com

Richard Schwed (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Jessica Delbaum (*admitted pro hac vice*)

SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP

599 Lexington Avenue

New York, NY 10022

Telephone: (212) 848-4000

rschwed@shearman.com

jessica.delbaum@shearman.com

Ryan Shores (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Michael Mitchell (*admitted pro hac vice*)

SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP

401 9th Street, NW, Suite 800

Washington, D.C. 20004

Telephone: (202) 508-8108

ryan.shores@shearman.com

michael.mitchell@shearman.com

Rachel Mossman Zieminski (*admitted pro hac vice*)

SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP

2601 Olive Street, Suite 1700

Dallas, TX 75201

Telephone: (214) 271-5385

rachel.zieminski@shearman.com

Attorneys for Defendant JetBlue Airways Corporation

Boston, MA 02108

Telephone: (617) 727-2200

Email: William.Matlack@mass.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of Massachusetts

/s/ Olga Kogan

Olga Kogan (*admitted pro hac vice*)

New York State Office of the Attorney General

28 Liberty Street, 20th Floor

New York, NY 10005

Telephone: (212) 416-8262

Email: olga.kogan@ag.ny.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff the State of New York

/s/ C. William Margrabe

C. William Margrabe (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Office of the Attorney General

400 6th Street NW, Suite 10100

Washington, D.C. 20001

Telephone: (202) 727-6294

Email: will.margrabe@dc.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff the District of Columbia

/s/ Schonette J. Walker

Schonette J. Walker (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Gary Honick (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Byron Warren (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Maryland Office of the Attorney General

200 St. Paul Place, 19th Floor

Baltimore, MD 21202

410-576-6470

swalker@oag.state.md.us

ghonick@oag.state.md.us

bwarren@oag.state.md.us

Attorneys for Plaintiff State Maryland

/s/ Komal K. Patel

Komal K. Patel (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Deputy Attorney General

Office of the California Attorney General

300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702

/s/ Andrew C. Finch

Andrew C. Finch (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Jay Cohen (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Eytayo St. Matthew-Daniel (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Kate Wald (*admitted pro hac vice*)

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON &
GARRISON LLP

1285 Avenue of the Americas

New York, NY 10019

Telephone: (212) 373-3000

afinch@paulweiss.com

jaycohen@paulweiss.com

tstmatthewdaniel@paulweiss.com

kwald@paulweiss.com

Meredith Dearborn (*admitted pro hac vice*)

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON &
GARRISON LLP

535 Mission Street, 24th Floor

San Francisco, California 94105

Telephone: (650) 208-2788

mdearborn@paulweiss.com

Attorneys for Defendant Spirit Airlines, Inc.

Los Angeles, CA 90013

Tel: (213) 269-6000

Email: Komal.Patel@doj.ca.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California

/s/ Bryan S. Sanchez

Bryan S. Sanchez (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Ana Atta-Alla (*admitted pro hac vice*)

State of New Jersey - Office of the Attorney
General

Division of Law

124 Halsey Street – 5th Floor

Newark, New Jersey 07102

Telephone: (973) 648-6835

Bryan.Sanchez@law.njoag.gov

Ana.Atta-Alla@law.njoag.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of New Jersey

/s/ Jessica V. Sutton

Jessica V. Sutton (*admitted pro hac vice*)

Special Deputy Attorney General

North Carolina Department of Justice Post Office
Box 629

Raleigh, North Carolina 27602

Tel: 919-716-6000

E-mail: jsutton2@ncdoj.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff State of North Carolina

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on May 26, 2023, I filed the foregoing document with the United States District Court for the District of Massachusetts using the CM/ECF system, and caused it to be served on all registered participants via the notice of electronic filing (the “NEF”).

/s/ Elizabeth M. Wright

Elizabeth M. Wright